



Investigating Ethnic Identity and national identity in Afghanistan (in Afghan universities)

Afganistan'da Etnik Kimlik ve Ulusal Kimliğin Araştırılması (Afgan Üniversitelerinde)

Abstract

National identity is a mental concept that represents belonging to a particular national group. National identity is accompanied by a complex set of conditions and feelings that indicate an individual's attitude towards his or her own group and other groups. The issue of national identity in Afghanistan has always been a very sensitive political and cultural issue because linguistic, ethnic, cultural, and religious differences in Afghanistan and ethnic and cultural similarities with the peoples of neighboring countries, as well as war, conflict, and destruction in Afghanistan, have prevented national identity from being fully formed in this country. The aim of this study was to examine the social and cultural factors related to the national identity of Kabul education students; In this study, social and cultural theories such as Giddens and Stryker were used to explain the national identity of students in three ethnic groups (Pashtun, Hazara, and Tajik). We used the survey method to collect data; the sample size was 372 people, which was taken using the systematic random sampling method; data analysis was also carried out using SPSS software; the findings of this study show that there is a significant and positive relationship between the variables of ethnic, religious, global identity and social capital, lifestyle and participation in national identity; In addition, based on multivariate regression, the variables of social and participatory lifestyle, religious identity, social capital, and gender explain 10.7 percent of the changes in the dependent variable.

Keywords: National Identity, Ethnic and Religious Identity, Lifestyle, Social Capital, Afghanistan.

Özet

Ulusal kimlik, belirli bir ulusal gruba ait olmayı temsil eden zihinsel bir kavramdır. Ulusal kimliğe, bir bireyin kendi grubuna ve diğer gruplara karşı tutumunu gösteren karmaşık bir koşul ve duygu kümesi eşlik eder. Afganistan'daki ulusal kimlik sorunu her zaman çok hassas bir politik ve kültürel sorun olmuştur çünkü Afganistan'daki dinsel, etnik, kültürel ve dini farklılıklar ve komşu ülkelerin halklarıyla etnik ve kültürel benzerlikler ile Afganistan'daki savaş, çatışma ve yıkım, bu ülkede ulusal kimliğin tam olarak oluşmasını engellemiştir. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Kabil eğitim öğrencilerinin ulusal kimliğiyle ilgili sosyal ve kültürel faktörleri incelemektir; Bu çalışmada, Giddens ve Stryker gibi sosyal ve kültürel teoriler, üç etnik gruptaki (Peştun, Hazara ve Tacik) öğrencilerin ulusal kimliğini açıklamak için kullanıldı. Veri toplamak için anket yöntemini kullandık; örneklem büyüklüğü, sistematik rastgele örnekleme yöntemi kullanılarak alınan 372 kişiydi; veri analizi de SPSS yazılımı kullanılarak gerçekleştirildi; Bu çalışmanın bulguları etnik, dinsel, küresel kimlik değişkenleri ile sosyal sermaye, yaşam tarzı ve ulusal kimliğe katılım değişkenleri arasında anlamlı ve pozitif bir ilişki olduğunu göstermektedir; ayrıca çok değişkenli regresyona dayalı olarak sosyal ve katılımcı yaşam tarzı, dinsel kimlik, sosyal sermaye ve cinsiyet değişkenleri bağımlı değişkendeki değişimlerin %10,7'sini açıklamaktadır.


Anahtar Kelimeler: Ulusal Kimlik, Etnik ve Dini Kimlik, Yaşam Tarzı, Sosyal Sermaye, Afganistan.

INTRODUCTION

Identity is considered one of the most important debates of the last century. Although the history of the issue of identity can be considered parallel to the history of humanity, the scientific raising and coloring of the issue of identity is one of the characteristics of modern societies.

The expansion of the concept of globalization, the growth of communication technologies, economic changes, and the phenomenon of migration in the modern world have led to fundamental changes in societies; these changes have affected the entire spectrum of social life. National identity in Afghanistan has always been considered one of the most important and important issues.

Because the linguistic, ethnic, cultural and religious differences of the people in Afghanistan on the one hand and the ethnic, religious and linguistic similarities of the people of this land with the people of neighboring

Mohammad Ekram Yawar ¹ 
Ay Bik Muhsini ² 

How to Cite This Article

Yawar, M. E. & Muhsini, A. B. (2025). "Investigating Ethnic Identity and national identity in Afghanistan (in Afghan universities)", International Social Mentality and Researcher Thinkers Journal, (Issn:2630-631X) 11(2): 240-253. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.15071961>

Arrival: 02 December 2024
Published: 25 March 2025

Social Mentality And Researcher Thinkers is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License.

¹ Asst. Prof. Dr., Dean of the Faculty of Law, International Science and Technology University, Warsaw, Poland

² Graduate Student in International Relations,

countries on the other, as well as the challenges, war, dispersion and destruction in Afghanistan have caused the national identity not to be formed in this territory, which is one of the most important reasons for the lack of a coherent and The ethnic, religious, and linguistic diversity of the Afghan people is the existence of ethnic groups outside the borders of Afghanistan that share cultural similarities with the Afghan people and cause the Afghan people to gravitate towards them.

National identity in other countries has brought about their cohesion, unity, and cohesion, and has provided the ground for progress and development; Therefore, the weakness of national identity is an issue that, if not addressed, will cause conflict, fragmentation, and backwardness in Afghanistan.

Based on what has been said, the main question of the research is “What is the impact of ethnic, religious, global identity variables, and social capital, lifestyle, and participation on the national identity of students in Afghanistan?” A survey method is used to answer this question.

Changes that have occurred not only in the groups and networks in which individuals find their identities crystallized, but also in the structure of the societies that enable these groups and networks to emerge and flourish.

Identity, which was primarily fixed in the past, is now constantly changing, evolving, and in crisis; This identity crisis, like other contemporary social phenomena, is global and therefore does not only affect advanced countries, but is also considered the most important problem facing underdeveloped countries. (Doran, 2008:53).

In order to maintain the unity and cohesion of their nation, which is considered a requirement for creating security in society, and to pursue their various goals and policies, various countries of the world inevitably emphasize the issue of a unified national identity. Achieving this unity is possible through the history, culture, traditions, and common interests and affiliations of a nation. The importance of this issue is to the extent that countries like America, which do not benefit from much historical precedent and whose people also do not benefit from the same national, ethnic, and cultural roots, engage in identity construction through planning; perhaps the experience of these societies has led thinkers to believe that the concept of nation is a product of the modern era and that modern nation-states digitize it. (Kavsi, 2009:4).

Ethnic, linguistic, cultural, and social groups are constantly seeking to integrate and shape themselves into a larger social system, as their elites strive to preserve and perpetuate their ethnic identity by emphasizing group affiliations and characteristics. There are numerous factors and developments that lead to changes in the identity levels of these groups and lead to types of ethnic nationalism that strive to maintain ethnic identity and prevent identification or integration with other groups; therefore, the more cohesive an ethnic group is, the more united and the source of economic, social, and cultural power it will have, and the better it will manifest its identity. (Giddens, 2019:12)

Most thinkers who research Afghanistan on this issue agree that in this land, the nation-state and national identity have not yet fully formed, and there are still active ethnic-tribal divisions and the possibility of conflict and conflict.

The Afghan government must find solutions to the issues that hinder the formation of national identity and cause ethnic divisions. In the current situation, Afghanistan is a country where national identity is very weak and fragile; In fact, identity is a set of heritage that belongs to one. Identity in the vast territory called Afghanistan has geographical, linguistic, religious and ethnic aspects; of course, it is clear that ethnic identity has a greater influence in giving life to behaviors. In Afghan society, individuals are not in the same position from the beginning, and classification criteria, including ethnic and relative characteristics, have a great impact on their social position. (Hettne,2010:34).

In Afghanistan, the weakness of national identity and the power of identity are strongly dependent on the element of ethnicity. For the formation of national identity, the presence of abstract values is required. Values in Afghanistan are not formed from fixed components for several reasons. The values of the non-feudal economic system that are the lifeblood of national identity are not observable in this society.

The “feudal economic system” produces its own corresponding structures, institutions, values, and norms. National identity is not formed within feudalism, so Afghan identity must be considered to be strongly influenced by ethnicity (Edwards, 1985:205).

Research Background Review

Amani (2012) in his study titled “Investigating Socio-Economic Factors Related to Social Identity of Kabul University Students” concluded that there was no significant relationship between the variables of age,

ethnicity, educational group, marital status, place of residence, social class, parental education, modern lifestyle, domestic and foreign media consumption, and social identity of the respondents, but there is a significant relationship between the variables of gender, social participation, social trust, self-confidence, traditional lifestyle, and self-satisfaction; in the multivariate regression in this study, it was determined that the variables of self-satisfaction, traditional lifestyle, and social trust had the highest correlation with the social identity variable; that is, with an increase in self-satisfaction, a stronger tendency towards a traditional lifestyle, and higher social trust, individuals have a stronger social identity.

Uruzgani (2011) in his book *Afghanistan: A Rainbow of Nations* concluded that the ethnic, cultural, linguistic, and religious diversity and complexity of today's Afghanistan are the product of the turbulent history of this land and other nations and countries in the region. The extensive migrations and displacements of human groups in the light of history, the special geographical location of this land as the crossroads and highway of the ancient continent of Asia, the diverse and multifaceted environment of the civilizational areas around it, its imposed and artificial boundaries and gaps, its harsh and incompatible internal environment and nature, and other factors; this structure and fabric of a population from the distant past have been remembered and are an inevitable and inescapable truth.

Heydari and Rahnward (2011) in their study entitled "Afghanistan, Foreign Forces and the Challenge of State-Nation Building" have shown that the widespread social, cultural, political, and economic disruptions in this country stem from the weakness of the state-nation building process. In other words, the powerful structure of literary, tribal, and religious values in Afghanistan's diverse society has made it impossible for power to be concentrated in a single ruler and the central government in Kabul.

Analysis and examination of the historical process, the existence of a weak state and a strong society, the multiplicity of ethnic, tribal, religious, and local identities, the imposition of Western-style democracy by Western countries, especially America, and the lack of attention to Afghanistan's social and traditional structures, indicate an increase in social and political tensions in Afghanistan over the coming years.

Yahyaei and Kia (2009) have conducted a study entitled "A Study of Cultural Identity and National Identity Concepts of the Nations of Iran and Afghanistan with Emphasis on the Attitudes of Afghan Immigrants to Iranians"; This study, while considering the cultural commonalities of the two nations of Iran and Afghanistan, considers the cultural identities of Iranians and Afghans to be a single entity and argues that only by accepting cultural diversity can the Iranian cultural identity become a deep-rooted umbrella over diverse cultures and achieve the unity of cultural identity.

Li, Zhuoran (2023) conducted a secondary analysis of "ethnic identity and national identity in Taiwan" after the decline of Chinese power in the region; their results indicate that historical memories and political superiority towards Taiwanese culture over Chinese culture have increased across all ethnic groups studied, and individuals identify themselves through Taiwanese identity.

Sablonniere, et al. (2010) conducted a study to examine the "role of relative deprivation and personal well-being" in ethnic and national conflicts in Kyrgyzstan in 2010. According to them, although feelings of relative deprivation played a determining role in creating dissatisfaction and conflict among ethnic groups, personal well-being was not absent in this. In this sense, the feeling of relative deprivation, along with relatively high personal well-being, has caused ethnic conflicts.

Sabatier (2008) in a study titled "Ethnic Identity and National Identity among Second-Generation Immigrant Adolescents in France: The Role of Social Context and Family", examines cultural identity based on two ethnic and national orientations with two elements of affirmation and exploration; In this study, based on ecological models of reconstruction, multiple layers of the social context were analyzed; socialization with peers, perception of discrimination, and various aspects of parents. Ethnic and national affirmation were considered as two independent tendencies; the results were promising for understanding the identity process; In this study, all layers of the social environment, such as peer group and perceived discrimination, are important, but parents seem to have the strongest influence. Adolescents' perceptions must be distinguished from what parents say. (Muridi, and Taghizadegan 2007);

Baily, (1994) has conducted a study on "Examining the Role of Music in the Creation of Afghan National Identity" and concluded that in the past, the role and influence of music in the creation of Afghan national identity was not pre-planned and conscious, and it is not possible to understand exactly how this process occurred. He also states that perhaps the musicians' views on national identity have influenced Afghan society. This situation has changed since the 1970s; in the sense that the role of music in reducing cultural and political conflicts in Afghan society has diminished.

In summarizing previous research, it should be said that most Persian research, with a pathophysiological perspective, has referred to the consequences and crisis of national identity; in these studies, there is good descriptive information about identity; This descriptive information is noteworthy in that it has revealed some of the realities of national identity among different strata.

The most important point of Persian research is that the results obtained from them, taking into account the existing cultural, economic and social conditions of Iran, are also useful for Afghan researchers. Most of the recent research has a good theoretical dimension. The Persian studies that have been conducted have more of a psychological and historical aspect and have less of a sociological approach to national identity; most of these studies have been conducted using survey methods and questionnaire tools.

What is noticeable in the review of foreign studies is the variety of topics studied, which, as mentioned, is not so noticeable in Persian studies; another issue is the higher volume of qualitative research compared to quantitative research. Conducting research using a qualitative method, on the one hand, enables these researchers to deeply investigate the subject under study and discover new horizons in research. On the other hand, qualitative research has little generalizability; another characteristic of English research is that it is quite limited in terms of subject matter. Therefore, this group of studies often discusses one of the dimensions of national identity and avoids addressing a multitude of issues.

Theoretical Foundations and Method

Theoretical Framework of the Research

National identity is in fact a phenomenon that is under the influence of multiple factors, therefore, a theoretical framework should be used that can explain the various dimensions of this phenomenon; therefore, we present a theoretical framework, consisting of the perspectives of Sheldon Stryker and Giddens, to explain the various dimensions of national identity.

Stryker's theory examines the salience of identity; This theory presents identity in relation to the individual and the social structure and examines it at an intermediate level. (Gong,li 2007);

Stryker's hierarchy of identity theory emphasizes that identities are representations that individuals make about their position in the social structure; these structural and positional representations are placed in a hierarchy of salience for him; (Omut, 2004); This prominence of identities causes an identity that is higher in this hierarchy to be used more for an individual than an identity that is lower; for this reason, the present study aimed to identify the types of possible identities that play a determining role in an individual's life and, on the other hand, are related to the subject of study. In this context, empirical studies were used and the concept of identity types was introduced into the research model; among these, four main identity types were identified among students, which were also directly related to national identity (the dependent variable); identity types include the following four groups:

1. Ethnic identity;
2. Global identity;
3. Religious identity;
4. Gender identity.

In the research process, due to the limitations of the research, gender identity was removed from further examination, but three other types of identity were included in the research model; in this regard, the following case was extracted:

Case number 1: Increasing commitment to national identity leads to:

- A - decreasing commitment to ethnic identity;
- B - decreasing religious commitment;
- C - decreasing commitment to global identity.

Stryker believes that identities are part of the self and, in fact, are internalized self-awarenesses that are connected to and associated with the positions that individuals take within the social structure; consequently, in his belief, identities are the connection between the self and the structure; He also believes that if structural constraints are low or the structure is vague and unclear, individuals can adopt multiple identities, but on the other hand, if the structure imposes numerous constraints on actors, the type of likely salience of identities

becomes predictable and individuals usually choose a salient identity for themselves (Striker, 2000: 286; Striker, 1999: 286). Castells, 2019: 29-34)

Therefore, social and contextual factors, or in fact, different structures, cause changes in the form and content of individuals' interaction; for this reason, the concept of contextual factors is extracted from Stryker's theory; this concept, or in fact, different structures of meaning to identity, will be measured using four factors: "age, type of religion, type of ethnicity, and gender".

Case number 2: A - Increasing the limitation of different meaningful social structures leads to a decrease in commitment to national identity and B - Reducing the limitation of different meaningful social structures leads to an increase in commitment to national identity.

Stryker also conceptualized the relationship between identity and social structure by establishing a relationship between commitment and identity; He defines commitment as follows: The degree to which a person defines his relationship with others based on his attachment to a particular type of identity; the greater this attachment to a particular type of identity, the more committed the person is to his identity and the higher this particular identity is in the hierarchy of salience; Meanwhile, he believes that the higher a person's sense of self-confidence, the greater his commitment to a particular type of identity, and in turn, high commitment to an identity itself leads to high self-confidence in the person.

In this study, Giddens's perspective is also used because it emphasizes the role and importance of modernity in the importance of national identity. In the field of identity, Giddens has discussed personal identity, renewal, and globalization. He believes that the changing shape of personal identity and the phenomenon of globalization in recent times have formed a dialectical dichotomy of the local and the global, such that even changes in the most private aspects of personal life are related to very broad social contacts. Indeed, the level and dimensions of spatio-temporal distance in the current era of renewal have reached such a level of expansion that, for the first time in human history, the self and society interact with each other in a global environment (Giddens, 2009: 28).

From Giddens' perspective, within the framework of new societies, the transformed self must be understood through personal explorations and made part of the process of mutual contact between personal and social changes, and We maintain that, but in explaining and describing personal identity, in addition to examining social contexts, attention should also be paid to the psychological structure of the individual, which should be based on the stratification model. (Giddens, 2009:57).

According to Giddens, the basic condition for acquiring personal identity is the establishment of basic trust. Personal identity cannot be considered in terms of its stability in time; Rather, identity, unlike itself, as a general phenomenon, does not require reflective awareness. Identity is in fact what the individual is aware of; in other words, personal identity is not something that is assigned to the individual as a result of ongoing social interactions, but something that the individual must create on an ongoing and daily basis. (Giddens, 2009: 86).

Based on Giddens' theory, the present study introduces the concept of different lifestyles into the conceptual model because, as he believes, with the entry into the era of late modernity and the expansion of communication media, identities have changed their status from being static and static to becoming fluid and dynamic; in fact, globalization has led to diversity in people's lifestyles by creating abundant opportunities for individuals. Individuals consciously choose and create their own lifestyles and ways of life, and in this way, they shape their identity. Giddens considers specific lifestyles and ways of life to be the producers of an individual's identity; therefore, the present study will extract the concept of lifestyle from Giddens's theory and measure it in two ways: cultural-leisure and social-participatory lifestyles. (Ritzer,2022)

Case number 3: A: Increasing the tendency towards cultural-leisure lifestyles leads to a decrease in commitment to national identity, and B: Increasing the tendency towards a social-participatory lifestyle leads to an increase in commitment to national identity. (Giddens,2022);

Research Hypotheses

There is a relationship between age and national identity.

There is a relationship between gender and national identity.

There is a relationship between mother tongue and national identity.

There is a relationship between ethnicity and national identity.

There is a relationship between marital status and national identity.

There is a relationship between ethnic identity and national identity.

There is a relationship between religious identity and national identity.

There is a relationship between global identity and national identity.

There is a relationship between cultural-leisure lifestyle and national identity.

There is a relationship between social-participatory lifestyle and national identity. (Muridi and Taghizadegan,2007)

Research Methodology

This study was conducted using a survey method and the necessary information was collected using a self-report questionnaire technique. In the present study, using the calculations made using the Cochran formula, the sample size was calculated as 372 people. The sampling method of this study is based on systematic random sampling, in which, by dividing the population size by the sample size, we obtain a sampling ratio in which one (1) person is given a questionnaire for every nineteen (19) people.

Kabul University of Education, which was the statistical population of this study, had seven thousand (7000) students studying in six faculties: Faculty of Language and Literature, Faculty of Social Sciences, Faculty of Natural Sciences, Faculty of Physical Education, Faculty of Vocational Education, and Faculty of Specialized Education, each of which had several departments. In this study, the “Faculty of Special Education” was excluded from six universities because its students were disabled, handicapped, blind, and mentally retarded. Four hundred (400) questionnaires were randomly distributed and collected in five other universities.

In the present study, in order to ensure the various aspects of the questionnaire's validity and to achieve face validity, we sought the opinions and guidance of some sociological experts and professors. Cronbach's alpha method was also used to measure the reliability of the research instrument (questionnaire).

Table 1: Reliability (Cronbach's alpha) of the number of attitude items in the questionnaire

Scale	Cronbach's alpha coefficient and number of items	
National Identity	26	0.807
Ethnic Identity	21	0.843
Religious Identity	16	0.758
International Identity	8	0.721
Lifestyle	13	0.770

Research Findings

The results of the study showed that out of 372 respondents, 55.9 percent were men and 44.1 percent were women. The average age of the respondents in this study was 67.21 for women and 66.22 for men. Most of the respondents, i.e. 72.6 percent, were Persian speakers and 24.2 percent were Pashto speakers; Also, among the total number of students studied, 25.3 percent of respondents were Pashtun, 37.4 percent of respondents were Hazara, and 31.2 percent of respondents were Tajik. Among the 372 students, 22 percent were married and 78 percent were single, and in terms of religion, 51.1 percent of respondents were Shia and 58.9 percent were Sunni.

In the following, considering the importance and priority of national identity and ethnic identity in the present study, questions and frequencies related to these two variables are presented:

The following table shows the frequency distribution of items related to the spectrum of national identity; This scale consists of ten (10) items and the scores for each item vary between 1 and 5, with a score of 1 indicating low national identity, which can range between 10 (minimum score) and 50 (maximum score). If an individual marks “neither” for all items, the average of their total score for these items will be 30; This table shows how to select options in different items.

As can be seen from the statistics in the table, regarding the first item, “When I hear the national anthem, I feel proud to be Afghan,” the average obtained is 4.38 out of 5, which indicates a relatively high attitude towards this item, but the sum of the scores obtained from these 10 items indicates a high level of national identity. The average obtained from all the items is 37.67, which is higher than the expected average (30), which indicates a moderate tendency; although this overall average is higher than 30, it indicates the respondents' tendency to agree with the items.

Table 2: Percentage distribution of respondents' agreement with the scale of students' national identity orientation (dimension)

Level of agreement of the statements	Ethnic Group	Disagree	Strongly Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree	Average	Total Average
Hearing the national anthem makes me proud to be Afghan	Pashton	0	3.2	3.2	25.5	68.1	4.59	
	Hazara	4.3	3.6	2.2	33.8	56.1	3.91	4/38
	Tajik	2.6	3.4	5.2	33.6	55.2	4.35	
The tricolor flag of Afghanistan is a source of pride for Afghans	Pashton	8.5	6.4	5.3	19.1	60.6	4.37	
	Hazara	3.6	10.1	1.4	27.3	57.6	4.21	4/21
	Tajik	3.4	9.5	6	25	56	3.61	
I wished I had been born in another country.	Pashton	3.2	19.1	19.1	30.9	27.7	3.29	
	Hazara	5.8	22.3	25.2	30.2	16.5	3.51	3/43
	Tajik	6	16.4	19.8	36.2	21.6	3.59	
If the opportunity arises, I am ready to leave Afghanistan forever.	Pashton	3.2	19.1	19.1	33	25.5	3.00	
	Hazara	10.8	23	21.6	30.2	14.4	3.54	3/2
	Tajik	3.4	17.2	24.1	31.9	23.3	3.27	
Life in Afghanistan is very difficult for me.	Pashton	5.3	18.1	36.2	25.5	14.9	4.21	
	Hazara	2.9	28.1	23	25.2	20.9	3.64	3/41
	Tajik	19.8	0	19.8	37.1	23.3	4.23	
I always like to speak Dari and Pashto, the national languages of my country, in official institutions.	Pashton	7.4	8.5	2.1	17	64.9	3.33	
	Hazara	4.3	2.9	5	43.2	44.3	4.37	4/24
	Tajik	3.4	1.7	6	31.9	56.9	3.32	
I prefer foreign clothes to Afghan clothes	Pashton	8.5	16	34	18.1	23.4	3.14	
	Hazara	7.9	19.4	48.2	13.7	10.8	3.04	3/10
	Tajik	12.9	14.7	39.7	20.7	12.1	3.13	
When speaking, I try to use foreign and non-national terms	Pashton	13.8	16	35.1	13.8	21.3	3.29	
	Hazara	5.8	11.5	46	20.9	15.8	3.18	3/22
	Tajik	13.8	14.7	33.6	15.5	22.4	4.14	
Wherever I see my compatriots in the world, I feel happy	Pashton	9.6	4.3	7.4	19	55	4.25	
	Hazara	2.9	3.6	2.2	36.7	54.7	4.48	4/35
	Tajik	3.4	1.7	1.7	29.3	63.8	3.39	
My future is intertwined with the future of my country	Pashton	5.3	14.9	6.4	28.7	44.7	4.34	
	Hazara	7.2	11.5	7.9	29.5	43.9	4.14	3/95
	Tajik	2.6	8.6	6	37.9	44.8	4.22	
Total Average								37/67

The table below shows the frequency distribution of items related to the ethnic identity spectrum of respondents; this spectrum includes 21 items. The scores for each item are rated between 1 and 5, with a score of 1 indicating complete disagreement (least ethnic identity) and a score of 5 indicating complete agreement (highest ethnic identity) with each item. The sum of the scores of the 21 items represents the ethnic identity scale score, which can potentially range between 21 (minimum score) and 105 (maximum score).

Table 3: Percentage distribution of respondents' agreement with ethnic identity

Level of agreement of the statements	Ethnic Group	Never	Little	Very Little	Much	Very Much	Average	Total Average
I spend a lot of time learning about the history and traditions of my people	Pashton	24.5	16.0	28.7	17.0	13.8	2.80	
	Hazara	16.4	17.3	31.7	25.9	8.6	2.93	2.74
	Tajik	18.1	35.3	27.6	16.4	2.6	2.50	
I would like to be more active in groups where my ethnic group is present	Pashton	29.8	27.7	18.1	14.9	9.6	2.47	
	Hazara	19.4	22.3	25.9	20.1	12.2	2.83	2.58
	Tajik	33.6	17.2	25.0	21.6	2.6	2.42	
I feel proud of my people	Pashton	34.0	20.2	9.6	11.7	24.5	2.72	
	Hazara	29.5	15.1	11.5	20.9	23	2.93	2.58
	Tajik	49.1	22.4	6.9	14.7	6.9	2.08	
I am sure that my tribe has had a positive impact on my life	Pashton	19.1	13.8	10.6	21.3	35.1	3.39	

	Hazara	7.9	22.3	17.3	35.3	17.3	3.32	3.12
	Tajik	26.7	19.8	18.1	27.6	7.8	2.70	
I am completely satisfied with my people	Pashton	10.6	19.1	2.02	18.1	31.9	3.41	
	Hazara	4.3	17.3	28.1	29.5	20.9	3.45	3.36
	Tajik	6.0	20.7	27.6	29.3	16.4	3.29	
I always consider myself loyal to my people	Pashton	17.0	11.7	20.2	26.6	24.5	3.30	
	Hazara	17.3	18.7	19.4	26.6	18	3.09	3.00
	Tajik	31.0	19.0	15.5	19.8	14.7	2.68	
Commitment to my tribe is evident in my behavior	Pashton	20.2	20.2	18.1	22.3	19.1	3.00	
	Hazara	18.7	18	32.4	16.5	14.4	2.90	2.74
	Tajik	31.0	28.4	12.9	19.8	7.8	2.45	
If I see a fellow citizen in trouble somewhere, I will go to her aid myself	Pashton	13.8	17.0	13.8	22.3	33.0	3.44	
	Hazara	9.4	22.3	12.9	35.3	20.1	3.35	3.27
	Tajik	17.2	22.4	16.4	31.0	12.9	3.00	
It is better for each nation to preserve its own traditions	Pashton	10.6	9.6	6.4	27.7	45.7	3.88	
	Hazara	5.8	10.1	22.3	29.5	32.4	3.73	3.79
	Tajik	6.9	10.3	13.8	34.5	34.5	3.79	
My people are braver and stronger than the rest of the peoples	Pashton	16.0	14.9	10.6	24.5	34.0	3.46	
	Hazara	18	14.4	17.3	30.2	20.1	3.20	3.16
	Tajik	27.6	15.5	16.4	24.1	16.4	2.86	
I think the customs and traditions of the people are ancient and backward	Pashton	33.0	5.3	16.0	24.5	21.3	2.96	
	Hazara	31.7	19.4	23.7	13.7	11.5	2.54	2.55
	Tajik	39.7	18.1	23.3	7.8	11.2	2.33	
Being a common language is my most important criterion for choosing a friend	Pashton	29.8	5.3	16.0	24.5	21.3	2.86	
	Hazara	32.4	12.2	19.4	21.6	14.4	2.73	2.68
	Tajik	42.2	14.7	13.8	11.2	18.1	2.48	
The problems of my people and tribe are my own problems	Pashton	22.3	17.0	9.6	21.3	29.8	3.19	
	Hazara	12.2	15.1	15.1	29.5	28.1	3.46	3.22
	Tajik	13.8	25.0	24.1	24.1	12.9	2.97	
I am very satisfied with my ethnicity (being Hazara, Pashtun, Tajik, etc.)	Pashton	18.1	13.8	11.7	19.1	37.2	3.44	
	Hazara	12.2	8.6	3.6	28.8	46.8	3.89	3.65
	Tajik	19.0	7.8	12.1	23.3	39.9	3.53	
Total Average								65.12

If each person marked “neither” for all the items, their average total score for these items would be 63; this table shows how the options were selected in the different items. As can be seen from the statistics in the table, regarding statement 16, “It is better for each nation to preserve its traditions,” the average obtained from Pashtun respondents is 3.88 out of 5, the average from Hazara respondents is 3.37 out of 5, and the average from Tajik respondents is 3.79 out of 5; The average of item 16 is 3.79 out of 5, which indicates a relatively high tendency for this item, but the sum of the scores obtained from these 21 items shows a very high level of ethnic identity; the average obtained from all items is 12.65, which is higher than the expected average (63), which indicates a moderate tendency; The higher this total average is than 63, the more likely it is that the respondents agree with the statements.

Hypothesis 1: There is a relationship between the age of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the Pearson correlation coefficient between age and national identity; the results obtained from this table indicate that there is a significant negative relationship at the 95 percent level between the age and national identity of the students.

Table 4: Pearson correlation coefficient between age and national identity by ethnicity

Dependent Variable	Independent variable of age	
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level
Total	-0.115	0.027

Hypothesis 2: There is a relationship between the gender of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the test of the difference in the average national identity of the respondents according to the gender of the sample; the results obtained based on the T-test rejected the above hypothesis and did not confirm a statistically significant difference among the students.

Table 5: Examining the relationship between respondents' gender and national identity orientation by ethnicity

Independent variable (gender)	Abundance	Average	Standard deviation	Standard error	T-value	Significance level
Female	163	1.1274	13.97	1.094		
Total Male	208	1.1048	14.094	0.9773	1.54	0.384

Hypothesis Three: There is a relationship between the mother tongue of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the test of the average difference in the national identity of the respondents in the two gender groups according to the mother tongue of the sample individuals; the results obtained based on the T-test reject the above hypothesis for both language groups; in this sense, there is no significant relationship between the language and the national identity of the students and the above hypothesis is rejected.

Table 6: Test of the relationship between the respondents' language and their national identity

Independent variable (language)	Abundance	Average	Standard deviation	Standard error	T-value	Significance level
Dependent variable (National Identity) Persian	270	1.002	13.20	0.803	0.163	0.870
Pashto	90	1.000	11.68	1.231	0.163	0.870

Hypothesis Four: There is a relationship between the type of ethnicity of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the average test of the national identity of the respondents in general and also by ethnic group; the results obtained based on the F test confirm the above hypothesis; The significance level is overall $p=0.000$, but in the Pashtun ethnic group $p=0.000$, Hazara $p=0.000$, and Tajik $p=0.000$, and the F test value is overall $F=-145.2$, but in the Pashtun ethnic group $F=-85.46$, Hazara $p=-84.76$, and Tajik $p=-85.26$. As a result, there is a significant negative relationship between national identity and ethnicity of students in general and also by ethnic group in all three ethnic groups, and the above hypothesis is confirmed in their case.

Table 7: Testing the relationship between respondents' ethnicity and national identity orientation

Independent variable (language)	Abundance	Average	Standard deviation	Standard error	F-value	Significance level
Dependent variable (National Identity) Total	372	2.13	0.808	0.043	-145.2	0.000
Pashton	94	1.007	11.31	1.166	-85.46	0.000
Hazara	139	99.54	13.42	1.138	-84.76	0.000
Tajik	116	1.012	12.54	1.164	-85.26	0.000

Hypothesis Five: There is a relationship between the type of religion of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the T-test of the type of religion of the respondents and the national identity of the students according to the ethnic group of the sample; the results obtained based on the T-test reject the above hypothesis and do not show a significant difference between the national identity and the type of religion of the respondents.

Table 8: Testing the relationship between respondents' religion and national identity orientation by ethnicity

Independent variable (Sect)	Abundance	Average	Standard deviation	Standard error	T-value	Significance level
Independent variable (National Identity) Sunni	220	99.99	12.48	1.093	-0.167	0.867
Shia	152	99.76	13.48	0.841		

Hypothesis Six: There is a relationship between the marital status of the respondents and their national identity.

The table below shows the T-test of the national identity of the respondents and marital status; the results obtained based on the T-test reject the above hypothesis.

Table 9: Analysis of variance of respondents' marital status and orientation towards national identity

Independent variable (Sect)	Abundance	Average	Standard deviation	Standard error	T-value	Significance level
Dependent variable (National Identity) Married	82	97.90	13.45	1.485	1.591	0.112
Single	290	1.004	12.69	0.745	1.591	0.112

Hypothesis Seven: There is a relationship between the ethnic identity of the respondents and their national identity.

The results of the Pearson test in the table below indicate that there is a significant positive relationship between national identity and the ethnic identity of the students in general ($p=0.002$).

Table 10: Pearson's correlation coefficient between ethnic identity and national identity

Dependent Variable	Ethnic Identity		
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level	Abundance
Total	0.159	0.002	372

Hypothesis Eight: There is a relationship between the religious identity of the respondents and their national identity.

The results of the table below indicate that there is a significant positive relationship between the national identity and religious identity of the students ($p=0.000$), so considering the significant level between these two variables, the above hypothesis will be acceptable.

Table 11: Pearson correlation coefficient between religious identity and national identity by ethnicity

Dependent Variable	Religious Identity		
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level	Abundance
Total	0.194	0.000	372

Hypothesis 9: There is a relationship between the global identity of the respondents and their national identity.

The results of the table below indicate that the national identity and global identity of the students (0.019) have a significant relationship.

Table 12: Pearson correlation coefficient between global identity and national identity

Dependent Variable	International Identity		
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level	Abundance
Total	0.122	0.019	372

Hypothesis Ten: There is a relationship between the level of cultural-leisure lifestyle of respondents and their national identity.

The results of the table below indicate that with an increase or decrease in the cultural-participatory lifestyle of individuals, their national identity does not change; consequently, there is no significant relationship between these two variables and the above hypothesis cannot be confirmed and is rejected.

Table 13: Pearson correlation coefficient between cultural-leisure lifestyle and national identity

Dependent Variable	Cultural-leisure lifestyle		
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level	Abundance
Total	0.078	0.276	372

Hypothesis Eleven: There is a relationship between the level of social and participatory lifestyle of the respondents and their national identity.

The results of the table below show that there is a significant and positive relationship between the national identity variable and the social and participatory lifestyle of the students ($p=0.000$).

Table 14: Pearson's correlation coefficient between social-participatory lifestyle

Dependent Variable	Social-participatory lifestyle		
(National Identity)	Coherence value	Significance level	Abundance
Total	0.201	0.000	372

SUMMARY

The present study began with the acceptance of the fact that identity, in the transition from the traditional to the modern world, has separated from its rigid and traditional form and has taken on a fluid and relative form; this has caused the internal dynamics of identity to be much greater than in the traditional world and its scientific understanding to become much more difficult and problematic, given the relativity of this phenomenon; In fact, identity is increasingly moving towards the individual and personal realm of individuals, and the diverse lifestyles of individuals shape their identities. (Turner, Jonathan (1999);

Personal identities, as Giddens believes, have been the result of the process of globalization and the expansion of communication and information media, but these same processes, as Castells argues, have been met with resistance from various collective movements that have sought their own collective and historical meaning. (Giddens,2022); In this regard, the present study attempted to investigate the national identity of students at Kabul University of Education.

Regarding the background variables (age, gender, language, ethnicity, religion, and marital status), the test of the research hypotheses indicated that there was no significant relationship between gender, language, religion, marital status, and national identity among any of the ethnic groups studied, but the relationship between the type of ethnicity in general, age, and national identity of the respondents was significant and had a negative correlation coefficient only among the Hazara ethnic group.

Studies by Amani (2012), Kavsi (2009), Salehi (2012), Taqwinsab (2007) and many other studies have pointed out the relationship between age, gender, language, ethnicity, religion and marital status and national identity of the individuals studied; as also pointed out in this study, there is a significant relationship between national identity and age of the Hazara ethnic group, which has seen the most social harm in the history of Afghanistan.

In fact, this relationship confirms the theoretical discussions related to discourse analysis; it is clear that national identity and age of the Hazara ethnic group had a negative effect on each other and, in general, increasing age leads to a decrease in the national identity of the Hazaras, which logically entails an awareness of past history and a decrease in national identity; Of course, it is important to state that in all groups studied, the averages of men are higher than the averages of women; this can also be traced in the study of Shafieitabar, et al. (2010).

Hypotheses (background variables) regarding the first case: Increasing the limitation of different meaningful social structures leads to a decrease in commitment to national identity, and decreasing the limitation of different meaningful social structures leads to an increase in commitment to national identity. Based on Stryker's theory and in line with him, it can be concluded that individuals perceive and identify themselves as objects in terms of their position in the social structure; As a result, the research results have also revealed that factors that are not more affected by structural limitations than the rest of the variables, such as age, gender, and language, are equally more influential than other factors in the emergence of national identity. The results of the study also confirm Stryker's theory by establishing a relationship between ethnicity and age and no relationship between gender, religion, ethnicity, and marital status (variables that have less structural limitations). (Gellner, 2023)

In the next stage of case number 1, increasing commitment to national identity leads to:

- A - decreasing commitment to ethnic identity;
- B - decreasing commitment to religious identity;
- C - decreasing commitment to global identity.

And 2: Reducing commitment to national identity leads to:

- A - increasing commitment to other identities;
- B - Choosing Multiple Identities

As the research results show, the relationship between national identity and ethnic identity among the two ethnic groups

Hazara and Tajik is not significant; however, in contrast to this relationship, for Pashtun students, there is a positive, strong, and direct relationship between these two variables; These results are consistent with the research of Rabbani et al. (2008), Kawsi (2009), Kiakjuri (2007), Ahmadloo and Afrogh (2002), and Gong (2007), regarding the Pashtun ethnic group, but the results of the research of Rohani (2011), Taqwinsab (2007) are not consistent with this hypothesis.

The results of the present study do not support the Striker theory; As stated in the previous sections, Pashtun students' orientation towards national identity has been much higher than other groups studied, and as a result, it has been argued that the relationship between national identity and ethnic identity among students is significant and positive.

Regarding students' religious identity and national identity, a significant and positive relationship was observed between all three ethnic groups, Pashtun, Hazara, and Tajik, and as with the previous two variables, this relationship is stronger among Pashtun students; the results of this study are consistent with Stryker's theory and contradict the hypothesis that increasing commitment to national identity leads to a decrease in other identities. Regarding the global identity and national identity variables, the results of the present study

Modify Stryker's theory.

The results of the present study indicated that there is a positive and strong relationship between national identity and global identity among the Tajik ethnic group; The results of this study are in contrast to those of

Sablonireh (2010), Urozgani (2011), Jalaipour and Ghanbari (2009), Fakuhi (2007), Hafeznia et al. (2006), Sasaki (2004), and Ezel et al. (2003).

Regarding these two variables, Stryker's theory and the case derived from it are modified because in the Tajik ethnic group, with the increase in global identity, its national identity is not weakened, but on the contrary, national identity and global identity have a direct and positive relationship; in this regard, Stryker's theory is reviewed; In addition, in this regard, we can point to the fluidity of the globalization process because this process creates a variety of choices for individuals by providing abundant opportunities; this leads to individuals choosing options and matters that help their national identity to stand out in the globalization process.

Regarding the formation of personal identity, Giddens believes that globalization and the emergence of information and communication technologies, by providing abundant opportunities for individuals, provide the possibility of forming personal identity for individuals; in fact, in his opinion, individuals form their identities through various ways and styles of life and through their choices. The results of the present study on respondents show that there is no significant relationship between cultural-leisure lifestyle and national identity; this empirical research neither confirms nor refutes Giddens' theory. Regarding the social-participatory lifestyle with students' national identity, Giddens' theory has been used in the stated hypothesis.

The results of the present study showed that there was a significant and positive relationship between the two variables of national identity and social-participatory lifestyle of individuals among all three ethnic groups (Pashtun, Hazara, and Tajik). The present results support the social-participatory lifestyle hypothesis because with increased activity in social-participatory lifestyles, individuals experience a collective and group spirit, and as a result, they show greater commitment to their collective identity. The results of the present study are consistent with Rohani's (2011) research and Giddens' theory. The present study, in line with Dovas, believes that "less research comes forward to fully confirm the initial theory" (Dovas, 2005: 28); accordingly, the present study confirmed the selected theories in some variables and strengthened their empirical foundations, but in some variables the selected theories were modified; Overall, national identity, ethnic identity, religious identity, global identity, relational social capital, social trust capital, social-participatory lifestyle, and domestic media among confirmed students actually show a positive and reciprocal relationship except for age and ethnicity, but ethnic identity, religious identity, social trust capital, social-participatory lifestyle, and the rate of mobile phone use in the Pashtun ethnic group. Regarding the research hypotheses, in the Hazara ethnic group, religious identity, age, social trust capital, social-participatory lifestyle, and the level of domestic media use, and in the Tajik ethnic group, religious identity, global identity, and social-participatory lifestyle have been confirmed in this study.

Conclusion

Afghanistan, as a multi-ethnic country, has been a focus of ethnic tide throughout its turbulent history. Nationalism manifests itself in two forms: positive nationalism of the French type, which is used to achieve independence and national unity, and negative nationalism, which is based on supremacy and racism. Afghanistan, unfortunately, has always experienced negative nationalism. In the country's political history, a dominant ethnic group has ruled the land based on a racist ideology, oppressing other ethnic groups.

Post-Taliban Afghanistan is a practical battlefield of ethnic tensions; the country still has an ethnic shape and face, and in certain provinces and urban areas it appears divided among the country's ethnic groups. The political power structure has been influenced by ethnicity since the time of Ahmad Shah Abdali. (Fahimi, 2013).

The presidential and parliamentary elections and the power balances that are currently taking place in Afghanistan all reflect the political reality that ethnicity is the basis of all Afghan political actions; In general, it should be said that Afghanistan suffers greatly from the lack of a national and collective identity acceptable to all ethnic groups in the country.

In the final section of this article, considering that the research is more focused on the social and cultural dimension related to national identity, therefore, suggestions are presented more in the socio-cultural fields focused on national identity.

Considering the level of significance of religious identity with national identity in each ethnic group and in turn, Considering the fact that the absolute majority of Afghan society is Muslim, emphasizing this common element of national identity in Afghanistan and highlighting it over points of division such as ethnic identity, nationality, and religion can further strengthen national identity in this country.

- Regarding social capital variables, social connections between individuals in different ethnicities should be improved in various ways in order to:

A - Increases people's knowledge of other ethnicities and cultures.

B - Increases generalized and out-group trust along with specific and in-group trust.

C - The social capital of individuals should be enhanced so that, as a result, the national identity of individuals prevails over their ethnic identity, thus providing the basis for development, progress, and integration; It is also suggested that by improving the quality and quantity of scientific and cultural institutions at various levels in universities and trying to encourage individuals to become members of these institutions, social ties can be established between students of different nationalities, thereby strengthening national identity and people's tolerance. This is because with increased ties, people's extroverted social capital increases, and the possibility of forming a sense of community, collective identity, and cohesion is greatly increased. It becomes more than just a special or unique identity.

Considering the level of significance of social-participatory lifestyles with students' national identity, this study suggests that in order to achieve various high-level programs, the curricular and extracurricular programs for students should be transformed into social-participatory styles to increase students' commitment and collective responsibility and save them from extreme isolationist and individualistic states; In fact, promoting social-participatory lifestyles also leads to an increase in students' social capital, which in turn leads to more and more students' tendency towards multiple and expanded identities.

REFERENCES

Amani, G. (2012); Study of socio-economic factors related to students' social identity: Kabul University, Senior Master's thesis in sociology, Shiraz University.

Omut, O.K. (2004); Theories of Nationalism; Translated by Mohammad Ali Ghasemi; Tehran: Publisher: Iranian Civilization Publications. For Access : <https://tinyurl.com/5944wakt>

Heydari, M.A. and Rahnward H. (2011); "Afghanistan, Foreign Forces and the Challenge of State-Nationalization", Policy Guide, Chapter, 2nd Year, Vol. 4, pp. 57-82. . For Access : <https://tinyurl.com/yckd8yjh>

Doran, B. (2008); Book: Social Identity: Approaches and Theories; Publisher: Jihad University Institute of Humanities and Social Studies. For Access :<https://tinyurl.com/2sewaxk8>

Ritzer, G. (2022); Book: Sociological Theory in the Contemporary Era; Translated by Mohsen Tolathi; Publications: Elmi. Tehran: P. 285, 300. For Access: <https://tinyurl.com/38zb37wd>

Castells, M. (2010); The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture; Vol. 2 (The Power of Identity), Hassan Chavoshian, Ali Paya (Senior Editor), Publisher., Tehran: Tarh-e-Nou, Iran .For Access: <https://tinyurl.com/mrxt9dbv>

Kavsi, F. (2009); Study of socio-cultural factors related to the national identity of high school students in Ahvaz city, Senior Master's thesis in Sociology, Shiraz University. Iran.

Giddens, Anthony (2019); The book of renewal and identification; translated by Nasser Mofaqian; publisher. Tehran: Nei Publishing .For Access: <https://tinyurl.com/34dtr3ex>

Giddens, Anthony (2009) Book, Sociology; Translated by Hassan Chavoshian; Tehran: Nei Publishing. . For Access: <https://tinyurl.com/4b6yvh6j>

Giddens, Anthony (2022); The Consequences of Modernity; Translated by Mohsen Tolathi; Publisher. Tehran: Center Publishing. For Access :<https://tinyurl.com/r5wkued8>

Gellner, E. (2023); Book, Nationalism; Translated by Seyyed Mohammad Ali Taghavi; Publisher. Tehran: Center Publishing. Iran .For Access .<https://tinyurl.com/3fww75xd>

Muridi, M. and Taghizadegan. M. (2007); "Investigating Identity Crisis Among Students (A Case Study of Students in Lar City in the Academic Year 2005-2006), National Studies Publisher; Vol. 30, pp. 145-168. Tehran, Iran .For Access :<https://tinyurl.com/2ppfbm65>

Uruzgani, M. (2011) Afghanistan: Rainbow of Nations. Publisher. Kabul: Sabh Omid. <https://archive.af/bib/27291>

- Yahyaei, S. and Kia, S. M. (2009); “A Study of the Concepts of Cultural Identity and National Identity of the Nations of Iran and Afghanistan with Emphasis on the Attitudes of Afghan Immigrants to Iranians”, Publisher, National Studies; 10th Volume, Vol. 1, pp. 135 to 156. For Access :<https://tinyurl.com/4huarc9c>
- Baily, J. (1994). “The role of music in the creation of an Afghan national identity:1923-1973,edited by Stokes, M, pp 45-60.
- Gong, li (2007); “Ethnic identity and identification with the majority group: Relations with national identity and self-esteem”, International Journal of, Intercultural Relations Vol. 31, No 4, pp, 503-523.
- Hettne, B. (2010); “Development And Security: Origins and Future”, Journal Of Security Dialogue, Vol. 41, No. 1, p, 34.
- Sablonniere, Roxanede la and Emilie Auger and Nazgul Sadykova and Danald M. Taylor (2010); “When the “We” Impacts How “I” Feel About Myself: Effect of Temporal Collective Relative Deprivation on Personal Well-being in the Context Vol. 15, No , of Dramatic Social Change in Kyrgyzstan”, European Psychologist 4, pp, 271-282.
- Sabatier, Colette (2008); “Ethnic and national identity among second-generation immigrant adolescents in France: The role of social context and family”, Journal of Adolescence , Vol. 31, Issue 2, , Pages 185-205.
- Turner, Jonathan (1999); The Structure of Sociological Theory. Wadsworth , pp, 330-496.
- Striker, Sheldon. (2000),.Identity theory in Encyclopedia of sociology, ed. EF Borgatta ML Borgatta, Macmillan.
- Stryker, Sheldon (1999). “Exploring the relevance of social cognition for the relationship of self and society: Linking the cognitive perspective and identity theory”, in the self-society dynamic Cognition, emotion, and action, Eds by Judith A. Howard and Peter L. Callero, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Fahimi, A.R. (2013) Afghanistan-Ma newspaper website, last updated 2013 . http://www.dailyafghanistan.com/opinion_detail.php?post_id=129527
- Edwards, G. (1985) Afghanistan The Soviet War. <https://archive.org/details/1985-afghanistan-the-soviet-war-by-girardet>
- Li,Zhuoran(2023) The Evolution of Identity in Taiwan That more and more people in Taiwan identify as “Taiwanese” and not “Chinese” is partially the result of Beijing’s own policies.
- Shafieitabar, M. Mazaheri, M. A. Anari, Asieh; M., E. The relationship between collective self-esteem and national identity in students, Publisher: Applied Psychology Fall 2010 - Issue 15 ISC (10 pages - from 96 to 105)